

**City of Syracuse
Citizen Review Board
Meeting Minutes
Thursday, June 7, 2018
5:30 PM to 7:30 PM
Common Council Chambers
Public Comment - 20 minutes at 6:30 PM**

Name	P	A	Name	P	A	Name	P	A
Carter, Mae	X		Natale, Dana	X				
Comeau, Herve	X		Nelson, Mary	X				
Grinnals, R. Daniels		X	Nilsson, Lori		X			
Holmes, Hatisha		X	Ryans, Clifford	X				
Kutz, Ruth	X		Releford, Ranette	X				
McCarthy, Peter	X		Pearson, Betty L.	X				

On Thursday, June 7, 2018, the City of Syracuse Citizen Review Board (CRB) held an open, stated meeting at 304 City Hall in the Common Council Chambers.

Mr. McCarthy, Board Chair, called the meeting to order and announced that the meeting was being held pursuant to notice and that a quorum was present.

1. On motion duly made by Mr. Ryans, seconded by Ms. Kutz and adopted, the Board approved the Minutes of the May 3, 2018.
2. Chairman's Items
 - a. CRB's Letter of Support of Syracuse Police Department's grant application for Body-Worn Cameras – The Syracuse Police Department has asked the CRB for a letter of support for their body-worn camera grant application. The letter will state the function of the CRB and that footage will be used in investigations. SPD expects to start using cameras in August or early fall. Mr. McCarthy – how are policies developed? Gather info from other CRBs. We currently see footage if it is in the OPS report and not erased or otherwise unavailable. Will it be available if not mentioned in a report? Mr. Comeau – Which officers will use them? Who finalizes policy? Answer – Corporation Counsel and Police Department.
 - b. Member participation in Community Outreach and Public Education events – Mr. McCarthy asked Board members to sign up for Community Outreach and Public Education events on the sign-up sheets provided.
3. Administrator's Report
 - a. Activity Report – All Annual and Quarterly Reports are current and posted on the website.

- b. Monthly Financial Report – Ms. Releford shared the detailed breakdown of expenditures for the year to date.
 - c. May case statistics – Ms. Releford reported that four new cases were received in May. She stated the total received in 2018 is 36 and that nine cases will be reviewed during Executive Session.
 - d. Grant Funding – Ms. Releford reported that she is looking into opportunities for grants and has met with the Gifford Foundation and Corporation Counsel for the procedures and process.
4. Committees
- a. Community Outreach and Public Education – Mr. Ryans reported that the CRB participated in or presented:
 - Unity Day, Friday, May 18, 3:00 PM to 6:30 PM, Jubilee Park, South Avenue
 - “Know Your Rights” with Teens, Thursday, May 31, 6:00 PM at NEHDA, Inc./Syracuse Northeast Community Center, 716 Hawley Avenueand will present or participate in:
 - Syracuse City School Districts Parent University “Know Your Rights” Presentation Tuesday, June 12, 2018, 5:30 to 7:00 p.m. at the Southwest Community Center
 - Juneteenth, Saturday, June 16, 12:00 PM to 10:00 PM, Clinton Square
 - Central New York Pride Festival Saturday, June 16, 12:00 PM to 6:00 PM, near the Inner Harbor
 - Southwest Showcase Sunday, June 17, 4:00 PM to 7:00 PM at Jubilee Park, South Avenue
 - Unity Day, Friday, June 22, 3:00 PM to 6:30 PM, Kirk Park

Ms. Natale and Messrs. Comeau, McCarthy and Ryans received feedback from the “Know Your Rights” presentation at NEHDA, Inc./Syracuse Northeast Community Center that included editing their document and discussing previous incidents in Syracuse.
 - b. Board Developments and Training – Mr. McCarthy reported that the full-day training took place on Saturday, May 19 and that Board members received very helpful information.
 - c. Government Relations – Board members attended as the City of Syracuse marked the start of Gun Violence Awareness Month and the two public meetings held on June 6 at the Institute of Technology at Syracuse Central and June 7 in the Community Room of the Central Library to obtain input on the addition of 100 body-worn cameras. The meetings had a presentation on the cameras’ technology and the Syracuse Police Department’s body camera policy, addressed when and how the cameras are used, how people will know when a

camera is operating and how the data and video footage will be stored. A demonstration of the cameras also took place.

- d. Police Relations – The Police Liaison Committee should meet every quarter and needs to set a meeting date prior to end of second quarter. Ms. Natale is interested in joining the committee. The committee members are Mr. Comeau, Ms. Kutz, Ms. Natale and Mr. Ryans. On motion made by Mr. Comeau, seconded by Ms. Kutz and adopted, the Board unanimously voted to write a letter to the Common Council formally addressing the concerns the police have with the CRB then in a public forum with the Common Council and Mayor Ben Walsh. SPD thinks the CRB is a joke. They laugh at decisions, letters and recommendations. There is a fear in the police culture, especially of Black men. SRO training is one hour a day for about a week. Be proactive with patterns seen in complaints. Mr. Ryans suggested reevaluating what the CRB stands for to reiterate to the DA and police.
5. New Business
 - a. CRB Study – Ms. Theresa Rocha Beardall, J.D., and a Ph.D. candidate at Cornell University will conduct a study of the Board that will proceed in three parts. The first step is to create an organizational timeline of the who, what, where and when of the Board from the paper trail that we have about who the Board is and how it made it through 25 years of organizational history – vision, obstacles, victories, etc. Second, she will move on to understanding how members are integrated into the Board (training, the expectations members have, how the design of the Board accommodates such diversity within this branch of city-government). The study will conclude by interviewing Board members, community members, police and other city officials interested in helping her understand how they perceive the power and authority of the Board. The goal is to triangulate any documents she can find with city-government design in Syracuse, demographic statistics and experiences or beliefs that others have about the Board in order to create an “organizational ethnography.” Organizational ethnography is where the academic contribution is a story about the organization as an important social actor, rather than a focus on a few individual personalities. This approach can demonstrate the Board’s central role in local police accountability that other communities can use as a model. Her research is part of her ongoing dissertation research and can become usable text for the CRB’s use too. She has studied police unions and civilian review boards that originate within union contracts. Syracuse’s Board is different because it comes from a local ordinance. Mr. Comeau asked Ms. Rocha Beardall to share the contract negotiation process. Mr. McCarthy asked about the timeline of the study. Ms. Rocha Beardall is willing to create a mutually agreed-upon calendar/timeline.

- b. Resolution 2018-1 – Mr. Thomas R. Babilon, an assistant Corporation Counsel with the City of Syracuse Department of Law presented a resolution to put in writing who supervises the Typist II. On motion made by Ms. Kutz, seconded by Mr. Ryans and adopted, the Board accepted the resolution:

WHEREAS, on June 7, 2018, The Syracuse Citizen Review Board (herein after "CRB") met during a regular Board Meeting held pursuant to Section 5 of its By-Laws; and,

WHEREAS, a quorum of CRB members were present as defined in Section 5(2) of the CRB's By-Laws; and,

WHEREAS, the CRB approved of the hiring of an Administrative Assistant/(Typist II) currently held by Betty Pearson by motion of the Board at a meeting held on July 5, 2012; and,

WHEREAS, Local Law No. 1 of 2012 Section 6(3)(d) sets forth certain responsibilities of the Administrator including “other tasks as needed or as directed by the Board and its Chair within the jurisdiction of the Board”; and,

WHEREAS, Local Law No. 1 of 2012 Section (6)(4) requires that the Administrator direct and supervise an investigator should an investigator be hired by the CRB; and,

WHEREAS, the CRB desires to clarify that the Administrator is and shall be responsible for the direction and supervision of the Administrative Assistant/(Typist II) position.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the CRB directs the Administrator that she shall be responsible for the direction and supervision of Administrative Assistant/(Typist II).

WHEREFORE, the aforesaid Resolution of the Citizen's Review Board, by a vote of seven in favor of the resolution, zero abstention, and zero voting against, herewith Adopts the Resolution on this 7th day of June, 2018 and in witness thereto and in verification thereof, appear the signatures of those CRB members present at the aforesaid meeting.

6. Public Comment (6:30 pm)

Mr. Mustafa Robinson shared thoughts on police-community relations and publicity for the CRB.

Mr. Mikiel Anderson made statements or asked questions regarding the CRB making inroads with SPD, the chief search, medical consultant and part-time investigator and the annual performance review of the Administrator.

Ms. Rocha Beardall asked questions about what the Board will allow regarding the presence of local police officers in executive session. These questions are not about what the Open Meeting Law will permit, but about the wishes and intentions of the Board. She stated that it is valuable to have a conversation with police on cases from time to time, but to admit police consultations in executive session before the Board makes a decision on that case could influence a Board member's decision in a way that does not prioritize their responsibilities to the public. Being able to talk about specific cases with police liaisons can be beneficial, but requests that the Board consider writing a policy to describe this relationship. Ms. Rocha Beardall asked the Board what they would say to the community if asked about police officers being welcomed into executive session and restated that she is seeking clarity and consideration of the public interest. She also asked whether or not Detective Mark Rusin will bring copies of the policies at issue for the Board to review the text of the policy or if he will be providing his interpretation of police policy without providing the Board with the policy text to consider for themselves.

7. Meeting continued in Executive Session.

During the Executive Session, the Board voted on the following cases to determine whether to forward the case to a CRB hearing:

17-061	No Hearing
17-065	No Hearing
17-066	No Hearing
17-068	No Hearing
17-077	No Hearing
17-078	Hearing
17-081	Hearing
17-097	No Hearing
17-100	No Hearing

On motion duly made, seconded and unanimously adopted, the Board adjourned its meeting.

Respectfully submitted,

Betty L. Pearson
Typist II, Citizen Review Board