

**City of Syracuse
Citizen Review Board
Meeting Minutes
Thursday, November 5, 2015
5:30 PM to 7:30 PM
Common Council Chambers
Public Comment - 20 minutes at 6:30 PM**

<u>Name</u>	<u>P</u>	<u>A</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>P</u>	<u>A</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>P</u>	<u>A</u>
Barber, William	X		Masella, Joseph	X				
Bullock, Douglas		X	Moser, Leah	X				
Christiana, Peter	X		Turner, V. Diane		X			
Horan, Carole J.		X	Lipari, Joseph L.	X				
Levine, Louis	X		Pearson, Betty L.	X				
Livingston, Mallory	X							

On Thursday, November 5, 2015, the City of Syracuse Citizen Review Board (CRB) held an open, stated meeting at 304 City Hall in the Common Council Chambers.

Mr. Barber, Board Chair, called the meeting to order and announced that the meeting was being held pursuant to notice and that a quorum was present.

1. On motion duly made by Mr. Masella, seconded by Ms. Moser and adopted, the Board unanimously approved the Minutes of the October 1, 2015, Board meeting.
2. Chairman's Items
 - a. Third Quarter Board Member Attendance – Mr. Barber reviewed the board members' meeting attendance for the third quarter. He reported that the attendance rate for the third quarter of 2015 was 86%. He reminded board members that the goal for attendance is at least 90%.
 - b. Report on Citizen's Police Academy, October 3 – Messrs. Lipari and Barber shared their experiences at SPD's Community Relations Division's "Citizen's Police Academy" training day on Saturday, October 3. Mr. Barber stated the role-playing scenarios were instructive and that the training day provided a valuable opportunity for SPD's training officers to meet and engage with CRB members. He reported that he, Mr. Christiana, Ms. Horan and Ms. Turner attended the training day along with the CRB Administrator.
 - c. CRB lawsuit for Onondaga County 911 records – Mr. Barber reported that the CRB's lawsuit against Onondaga County to receive access to 911 audio recordings and radio transmissions for investigations was successfully resolved without having to go to court. He indicated that the 911 Center will now provide such records to the CRB upon request.

- d. CRB contract requests for medical consultant and investigators approved – Mr. Barber reported that at its regular meeting Monday, October 26, the Common Council voted unanimously (8 to 0) to approve the CRB’s proposed contracts with Scientific Consulting of Western New York to provide medical review services and with AG Investigations, LLC to provide investigative services on an as needed basis through June 30, 2016.
 - e. Civil service laws and SPD discipline – Mr. Barber shared information regarding civil service laws and disciplining a police officer. He noted that the discipline recommended by the CRB panel to the Chief of Police could result in an Article 78 hearing under the State of New York Civil Service Law. Mr. Barber added that if the Chief of Police decides to impose discipline, the officer has the opportunity to respond and then the officer is formally presented with the allegations. Mr. Barber also stated that the officer can accept the imposed penalties or challenge the discipline at a civil service hearing. Mr. Barber continued that under most circumstances the article 78 civil service hearing is a cost to the City to represent itself, while the PBA union would represent the officer with legal advice. Mr. Barber also said that when challenged by the officer, the outcome of the disciplinary process in most circumstances is determined by binding arbitration.
 - f. 40-under-40 Awards Luncheon – Mr. Barber reported that every year the Business Journal News Network’s 40 Under 40 recognizes 40 ambitious, hard-working, civic-minded individuals under the age of 40 who serve with distinction in their workplace and in our community. Mr. Barber indicated that the Board nominated Mr. Lipari for the award and he was selected as one of the honorees. Mr. Barber invited all board members to attend the award luncheon on Thursday, November 19, 2015, in the ONcenter Convention Center Ballroom from 12:00 PM to 2:00 PM. Ms. Pearson indicated that any board member interested in attending the function can send their \$65.00 payment to her at the CRB office and she will forward it to BizEvents to reserve seats so that CRB attendees can sit together.
3. Administrator’s Report
- a. Contract selection for Spanish-English translations/interpreters – Mr. Lipari presented additional information on the potential vendors for the CRB to contract with to provide translation services for the agency. Mr. Lipari indicated that MAMI can provide certified translators as well as communication services for those with disabilities. While La Liga as an agency is certified, Mr. Lipari added, individual interpreters for La Liga are not. On motion made by Ms. Livingston, seconded by Mr. Masella and unanimously adopted, the Board approved contracting with MAMI for translation and interpretation services in any of the 55 languages they provide.
 - b. Reminder for December Decision: Should the CRB Subpoena Officers to Hearings? – Ms. Livingston stated that complainants should be informed that

subpoenaing officers to hearings is an option and that if the complainant wishes to have the officer at the hearing then the CRB should subpoena the officer to the hearing.

- c. Report on NACOLE Conference, October 4 to 8 – Mr. Lipari reported that he attended the annual NACOLE conference in Riverside, California and served as a panel member for the International Perspectives on Police Oversight session. Mr. Lipari indicated that he and three other panelists shared their experiences and perspectives on oversight in the international arena and discussed ways to share knowledge about creating and enhancing police accountability and transparency. Mr. Lipari discussed his experience in Russia as part of the Eurasia Foundation US/Russia Social Expertise Exchange Fellowship Program.
 - d. Report on Fall CRB outreach events – Mr. Lipari reported on CRB outreach events over the past month. He noted that he conducted outreach events at Betts Branch Library, October 14; White Branch Library, October 15; and Mundy Branch Library, October 28. In addition, he indicated that on Saturday, November 7, the City of Syracuse, the Gifford Foundation and the Central New York Community Foundation (CNYCF) are sponsoring Syracuse Neighborhood Action Conference (SNAC) at Nottingham High School, 9:00 AM to 3:00 PM. He reported that fifteen workshops will be presented on subjects ranging from navigating City government to financial literacy, citizen action and public speaking. Mr. Lipari indicated that he will participate in a panel discussion titled Syracuse Matters and that it will provide attendees an opportunity to hear from law enforcement and community members who are striving to make Syracuse a more vibrant and safer community for all.
 - e. Monthly Financial Report – Mr. Lipari shared the detailed breakdown of expenditures for the year to date.
 - f. October case statistics – Mr. Lipari reported that one new case was received in October. He stated the total received in 2015 is 56 and that 11 cases will be reviewed during Executive Session.
4. Committees
 - a. Board Training & Development – Mr. Lipari indicated that the Board Development and Training committee (Mr. Barber, Mr. Levine and Ms. Moser) should begin planning the annual CRB Training/Strategic Planning event to be held in February 2016.
5. New Business

There was no new business.
 6. Public Comment (6:30 pm)

Mr. Mikiel Anderson asked questions or made comments about Councilor Pamela Hunter's resignation from the Common Council, Board vacancies, consolidated metropolitan government, school resource officers, body cameras, discipline of officers, 911 records, centralized legal services, the Police Liaison Committee, the use of force policy, police contract negotiations, the third quarterly report, the administrator's evaluation, the Board chair and vice chair, possible changes to the CRB ordinance, and the translator contract.

7. Meeting continued in Executive Session.

During the Executive Session, the Board voted on the following cases to determine whether to forward the case to a CRB hearing:

08-039	No Hearing
15-026	No Hearing
15-039	No Hearing
15-041	No Hearing
15-042	No Hearing
15-049	Hearing
15-050	No Hearing
15-051	Hearing
15-052	No Hearing
15-053	No Hearing
15-054	No Hearing
15-055	No Hearing

On motion duly made, seconded and unanimously adopted, the Board adjourned its meeting.

Respectfully submitted,

Betty L. Pearson
Typist II, Citizen Review Board