



**Landmark Preservation Board
Thursday, December 4, 2014**

Meeting Minutes

Common Council Chambers

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Don Radke called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m.

ROLL CALL

Members Present: Tom Cantwell, Cynthia Carter, Bob Haley, Dan Leary, Don Radke, Jeff Romano, Joe Saya

Excused: Julia Marshall

Staff: Kate Auwaerter

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of November 20, 2014 were approved unanimously as submitted on the motion of D. Leary, which was seconded by T. Cantwell.

OLD BUSINESS

CA-14-25 116 Windsor Place. John Joyce and Kathleen Boudreau (the applicants) presented additional information regarding their window replacement project at 116 Windsor Place. They provided the Board with their contractor's cost estimate for the rehabilitation of the historic windows noting that it was approximately 40% more than replacing the windows with the proposed aluminum clad wood windows. They stated that the lead remediation was key to the higher cost. They also presented information that indicated that the existing windows and the proposed replacement windows had identical measurements and would appear identical from the public right-of-way. J. Joyce also indicated that they preferred the replacement windows for energy-efficiency reasons. Finally, he noted that safety was a concern; specifically, that the older windows with an exterior storm did not provide the same type of ease of emergency egress that a modern window would.

C. Carter reiterated that the Board has allowed applicants to replace windows but only in-kind. The applicants noted that they had identified a manufacturer of wood windows with a factory-applied acrylic paint. These windows were approximately \$1000 per window. Other painted, full-wood windows are available but would need to be periodically repainted-- the applicants stated that they wanted to avoid this long-term maintenance issue. In discussion, C. Carter noted that the Board is unable to consider cost in its deliberations.

D. Radke restated that the Board has not approved aluminum clad windows in a residential context -- to do so would be a policy change that needed careful consideration. The Board has directed staff to conduct research into window replacement policies of other Upstate preservation commissions, which would take several weeks to complete. When asked, the applicants stated that they believed the aluminum-clad windows were their best option and indicated that they did not want to hold the application open pending Board policy discussions.

C. Carter made a motion to deny the application as submitted based on Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation Criterion 6. D. Leary seconded the motion. The motion passed on a majority vote with T. Cantwell voting "no" and J. Saya abstaining.

NEW BUSINESS

No new applications

Zoning Referrals

Project Site Review: 500 N Salina Street. John Ceresoli (Dalpos Architects) presented an overview of the project to upgrade the exterior of the former bank building that is now used as a training center for St. Joseph's hospital. The intent is to use similar materials (metal siding) and colors as those used in the new construction at the hospital and as seen in some of the hospital's other facilities. K. Auwaerter noted that the property is adjacent to but not part of the N. Salina Street Historic District. The Board reviewed the application and agreed to recommend approval of the application as submitted.

Project Site Review: 664 W Onondaga Street. Bruce King (Holmes King & Kallquist Architects) and Pat Stanczyk (Housing Visions) were present at the meeting. B. King provided a letter from the SHPO that indicated that the building is not eligible for the National Register. Nonetheless, the developers have adopted a preservation approach to the project and will repair and repoint masonry, restore and/or replicate the decorative urns along the parapet wall, and install new fiberglass windows to match the configuration of the old windows which are damaged beyond repair. On the side elevations, some paired windows will be narrowed to a single window unit (because of the interior layout). Former window openings will be bricked over; the new brick will match the existing and will be inset to create a shadow affect. The Board noted its interest in the fiberglass windows; B. King confirmed that the muntins would be exterior applied. The Board agreed to recommend the approval of the project as submitted.

Sign Waiver: 622-26 & 628-30 N State Street/456-60 N Salina St. K. Auwaerter noted that because the sign band over the shopfront is divided into three sections, the proposed sign, which spans the three sections, is considered three separate signs and therefore requires a waiver. If the signband were a single panel, the proposed sign would fit within the size requirements of the Sign Ordinance without a waiver. K. Auwaerter noted that the signband design a response to the recommendations of the Board. The Board agreed that the sign is appropriate for the shopfront and does not detract from the surrounding historic district. The Board agreed to recommend approval as submitted.

ADJOURN

The meeting was adjourned at 9:20 AM.