



Landmark Preservation Board
Thursday, February 18, 2016

Meeting Minutes

Common Council Chambers

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Don Radke called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m.

ROLL CALL

Members Present: Cynthia Carter, Tom Cantwell, Bob Haley, Dan Leary, Don Radke, Jeff Romano, Joe Saya

Excused: Julia Marshall

Staff: Kate Auwaerter

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of February 4, 2016 were approved unanimously on the motion of J. Romano, which was seconded by C. Carter with the following corrections:

CA-16-01: 259-277 E Onondaga St (Cathedral of the Immaculate Conception Parish Center). B. Haley asked if they had investigated *other window manufacturers that may have products that are a closer match to the original windows than the proposed Quaker brand windows*. C. Brace said that they had not.

CA-16-02: 616 Rugby Road. The Board discussed the project and the majority of Board members agreed that the panels facing the street *would alter the character of the roof of the house and would be a visual intrusion within the surrounding historic district*.

OLD BUSINESS

No Old Business

CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

CA-16-03: 9 Brattle Road. David Colegrove (Harmony Architectural Associates) presented the application to expand an existing addition on a garage that is a contributing structure in the Sedgwick-Highland-James Preservation District. It is a two-story garage with a living space on the second floor. There is a single-story, flat roofed addition located on the east side of the garage, the roof of which is used as a patio for the upper story living space. The second story is currently accessed via a spiral staircase on the northeast corner of the garage behind the addition. The proposal is to remove the metal staircase and build a second story onto the addition and install an enclosed stairwell within the expanded addition. The addition would be slightly stepped back from the main (south) façade of the garage but will be the same height as the garage. A new window and door will be installed on the south face of the addition and three new windows will be installed on the second floor of the east face of the addition. The addition would be faced in stucco to match the garage and house.

The Board reviewed the application. In discussion, it was noted that the basic form of the garage is a symmetrical box with a single-story, later addition that alters the character of the garage. The Board noted that the proposed two-story addition would further compromise the garage's form and visual character. The Board discussed with D. Colegrove alternatives including placing the stairwell inside the garage or in a less visually intrusive location, or lowering the roof height of the addition so that it does not match that of the original structure. D. Colegrove provided explanations for why the other solutions proposed may not be feasible including the limitations of the structure as well as the client's desired use of the space. In

discussion, D. Colegrove noted that it had not yet been determined whether or not current Zoning allows the occupancy in the garage structure. With that, the Board moved to table the application on a motion by D. Leary which was seconded by B. Haley pending determination of whether the residential use was allowed by Zoning.

CA-16-04: 140 E. Genesee Street. Fouad Dietz (Ashley McGraw Architects) and Jed Schneider (Le Moyne College) presented the application for new signage for Le Moyne College's Occupational Therapy offices on the ground floor of the Larned Building. The signage consists of vinyl decals of the college logo and name on a white background. The signage will be installed on the inside of the glass at the base of the shopfront windows and in the transoms over the doors at the S. Warren Street and E. Washington Street entrance of the building, at the base of the storefronts on the corner of the building at S. Warren Street and Hanover Square, and in the transoms and on the doors to the main Hanover Square entrance. There will be a total of 9 signs, which K. Auwaerter explained was more than was allowed by the Sign Ordinance without a waiver. The Board discussed the project with the applicants, in particular about number and placement of the signs. In addition, the Board discussed the possibility of maintaining 80-90% transparency of the glass, so that the signs appeared as lettering on frosted glass rather than as opaque, white signs. C. Carter made a motion to approve the application as submitted, which was seconded by T. Cantwell. The motion passed on a majority vote; D. Leary voted to deny the application.

CA-16-01 (Modification): 259-277 E. Onondaga Street. Connie Brace (QPK Design) and Wayne Palmetter (Hueber Breuer Construction) presented the modification to the site work and masonry repairs scope of work. The modifications included replacing the existing cast stone cap on the main chimney with a concrete cap and installing a copper cover over the flues. D. Leary recommended that the lid to the copper cover have a lower profile in order to reduce its visibility. In addition, the modifications included the installation of lighting on the face of the building at the new ramp at the rear of the building. The purpose of the lighting is to illuminate the ramp, the new entrance door off the ramp, and an existing entrance adjacent to the ramp. The application called for wall mounted fixtures for the new lighting. In discussion, it was noted that the light fixtures would need to be mounted through the stone. In order to avoid this damage, D. Leary recommended a single, free-standing light pole located between the two entrances. The project representatives agreed that this would be a satisfactory solution and that the light pole would match the other free standing, ground mounted poles (simple round poles with black lanterns) on the Columbus Circle side of the building. B. Haley made a motion to approve the application with the following conditions: that the copper chimney cover will have a low profile, and that the lighting for the ramp and back doors will be supplied by a free standing ground-mounted light pole to match the poles installed on the Onondaga Street side of the property. The applicant is to submit the pole specifications to staff for review and approval. The motion was seconded by C. Carter and approved unanimously.

CA16-05: 259-277 E. Onondaga Street. Connie Brace (QPK Design) and Wayne Palmetter (Hueber Breuer Construction) presented the application for window replacements in the Parish Center. The proposal is to replace 86 windows in total with Sierra Pacific aluminum-clad, wood windows to match the configuration of the original windows (primarily 1-over-1 double-hung sash). Those windows with muntin bars will have simulated exterior applied muntins with a "Putty Profile". In addition to the window replacements, the proposal includes the repair and restoration of 7 windows primarily on the ground floor that feature diamond patterned glass. These windows will be repaired and protected by fixed, exterior storm windows. The Board also noted that approximately 16 single and paired sets of windows had been replaced already in the Bishops Residence portion of the building without Board approval and with a window that the Board had determined is not an acceptable replacement for the original windows. The Board discussed the project as a whole and the effect of the mismatched windows on the visual qualities of the property. The Board noted that the windows that had already been replaced in the Bishops Residence should be included in the replacement scheme in order to give the property a cohesive appearance. D.

Radke noted that during the January 21, 2016 site visit, a representative from the Diocese had agreed that the windows would be replaced if another window were approved. D. Leary remarked that the application did not include details of how the windows would be installed into the existing openings, noting that they should fit into the openings exactly with no panning. B. Haley made a motion to approve the proposed window replacement with Sierra Pacific aluminum-clad windows with the following conditions: that the applicants submit a detailed description and drawings of the window installation; that the applicants submit a color sample for the new windows; and that the inappropriate new windows in the Bishop's Residence are removed and replaced with the Sierra Pacific windows approved for this project. The motion was seconded by T. Cantwell and passed unanimously.

ZONING REFERRALS

No Zoning Referrals

DISCUSSION

Lower Onondaga Park: Park boundary expansion. Glen Lewis discussed the opportunity to expand Lower Onondaga Park with the acquisition of two parcels of vacant land owned by the Land Bank located adjacent to the park boundaries. He noted that there was no plan to change the actual boundaries of the historic park. The purpose of the acquisition was to protect the park assets. He noted that the Parks Department was looking at other Land Bank parcels that might be acquired at Onondaga Park and other parks in the city.

The Board was supportive of the proposal in this specific instance. However, J. Saya stated that on balance he was not in favor of taking taxable parcels and converting them to parkland. B. Haley noted that an important feature of urban parks is their hard edges. These edges are delineated by dense residential neighborhoods that give way to open expanse of parkland and nature. Demolition of properties next to parks should be reviewed carefully and managed so that it does not negatively impact this important characteristic. To this end, he encouraged the Parks Department to work with the Land Bank to preserve structures at the park boundaries, even potentially for park use.

ADJOURN

The meeting was adjourned at 10:00 AM.