



*SYRACUSE
LANDMARK
PRESERVATION
BOARD*

**Landmark Preservation Board
Thursday, May 4, 2017**

Meeting Minutes

Common Council Chambers

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Don Radke called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m.

ROLL CALL

Members Present: Cynthia Carter, Bob Haley, Dan Leary, Julia Marshall, Don Radke, Jeff Romano, Joe Saya

Excused: Tom Cantwell

Staff: Kate Auwaerter

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of April 20, 2017 were approved unanimously as submitted on the motion of C. Carter, which was seconded by J. Marshall.

OLD BUSINESS

Project Site Review (PR-17-04): 728 East Genesee Street. Andrew Schuster, Jason Evans, and Ed McGraw of Ashly McGraw Architects presented the revisions to the plans for the new apartment building on the site that includes the former First Church of Christ Scientist. A. Schuster provided comparative images and renderings of the site, which indicate that the view of the west side of the historic church is obstructed by existing vegetation and by the former church school addition/credit union located immediately to the west of the church. He noted that the distance between the former church and the proposed new construction was greater than the distance between the church and school/credit union. He also referred to the Board's earlier comments and noted that they have proposed full-height glazing for the ground-floor commercial space on E. Genesee Street in order to allow the maximum transparency between the two buildings. The Board was satisfied with this modification.

A. Schuster also introduced a major change to the site plan that would impact the new construction. Access to the site and parking garage (located on the first floor of the new building) was proposed to be located from Cedar Street, which runs parallel to E. Genesee Street. Cedar Street is controlled by the NYS Office of Mental Health and historically the owners of 728 E. Genesee Street have had an agreement with OMH to access their property from the Cedar Street side. However, OMH is concerned about the potential additional traffic along Cedar Street and has revoked the access agreement. Therefore, the entrance to the property will be now located from an existing curb cut on E. Genesee Street on the west side of the school/credit union and the entrance into the parking garage will be located at the northwest corner of the new building, which will cut into the footprint of the commercial space. The Board noted that the alteration was acceptable; however, they also noted that they preferred the Cedar Street access from a design standpoint. The Board stated that it would encourage OMH to reconsider its position in its comments to Zoning.

New Business

Certificates of Appropriateness

CA-17-08 723 James Street (new signage). Sara Sturtz (King & King Architects) and Andrea Drake (Signage Systems) presented the proposal for new signage at 723 James Street. The proposal includes installing a new ground sign in the front of the property, perpendicular to James Street, located in the tree lawn west of the property's driveway. The sign will be approximately 7'h x 6'w and consists of a flat, 2-sided panel between two round posts. The sign will be ground lit. This sign will replace an existing sign that has similar dimensions

and is located just to the east of the driveway. In addition, the proposal calls for reusing an existing ground sign located at the edge of the parking lot on the E. Willow Street side of the property. The sign is a 3' w x 6' h box sign on a raised foundation. Both faces of the existing sign will be switched out with the Vera House name and logo. The Board discussed the signage with the applicants. J. Marshall made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the sign panel on the James Street sign be lowered 18" within its frame in order to reduce the visual scale of the sign and improve the pedestrian environment along James Street. The motion was seconded by C. Carter and approved unanimously.

CA-17-09 102 Berkeley Drive. The applicant was not present. K. Auwaerter described the proposal to install a gutter along the width of the front façade of the house. The gutter is necessary to direct water away from the foundation of the house. The gutter will be a metal, K-style gutter painted to match the color of the fascia. The new metal downspout will be directed under the soffit and down the south side of the house and will be painted to match the color of the soffit and house. It was noted that in this instance, the K-style gutter was appropriate because it would have a low profile and would be less visible than other types of gutters. J. Marshall made a motion to approve the application as submitted, which was seconded by C. Carter. The motion passed unanimously.

Zoning Referrals

Project Site Review (PR-16-08): 501-05 N Salina Street & S Butternut St. George Angeloro was present to discuss his application. The proposal includes the addition of a storage area on the east side of the single-story, concrete block, Rent-A-Center building that faces Butternut Street. G. Angeloro explained that the design of the storage addition reflected Board comments from spring 2016, with the exception that the door facing N. Salina Street would be a paneled door with glazing and no transom rather than the flat door with transom that the Board had suggested. G. Angeloro explained that the new door matches the height and overall appearance (minus the transom) of the front door to the adjacent historic building. The majority of the Board found the proposed design acceptable.

In addition to the storage addition, the application includes the construction of a new dumpster enclosure next to the storage addition. G. Angeloro noted that he was required to move the two existing dumpsters out of the N. State Street ROW and onto his property. The shape of the lot made it necessary to place the dumpsters and enclosure abutting N Salina Street. The enclosure would be concrete block painted to match the color of the brick on the adjoining property. It would be constructed on the inside of the existing decorative fence at the corner of the lot. The Board discussed the proposal with the applicant and suggested that instead of a dumpster enclosure, he should consider a low brick wall that would run along the property line of the parcel up to and around the corner. An alternative would be brick piers with fencing (as at the Dunkin' Donuts on N. Salina Street). G. Angeloro said he would consider the fence or wall idea.

Project Site Review: 235 E Water Street. Rick Esposito (owner) and Chris Norris (Holmes King Kallquist) described the rehabilitation project for 235 E. Water Street. The ground floor will be used as commercial space and the upper floors will be converted into apartments. C. Norris noted that both the south (E. Water Street) and north (Erie Boulevard) sides of the building had been substantially altered. On the south side, the original storefront had been removed and replaced with a ceramic tile facade with high transom windows. The upper stories are generally intact. On the north side, the ground floor was completely bricked over with the exception of a single entrance, and the upper floor windows were replaced with bands of modern metal windows. The proposed project will restore the E. Water Street side to include a new metal storefront with a center entrance and flanking storefront windows. On the Erie Blvd side, a new metal storefront will be installed and the upper stories will feature three sets of double-hung, aluminum-clad windows on each floor. The siding between the floors will be removed and replaced by fiber cement panels.

The Board was in support of the proposed project. B. Haley suggested that the transoms over the storefront windows on the south façade (E. Water Street) should be glass rather than fiber cement panels. The Board agreed to recommend approval of the project with the comment although the proposed transom panels over the

new storefronts on the south side (E. Water Street) of the property were acceptable, glass transoms would be preferable as this was typical of the era prior to the introduction of electricity. R. Esposito stated that he had photo documentation indicating that the panels were solid (not glass) historically. Staff requested that the owner provide the image of the property for the file.

Project Site Review (PR-17-09): 214 W. Water Street. Mark Congel (owner) and James Trasher (CHA Consulting) presented the proposal for a 6-story addition on the west side of the Amos Block. The addition will feature parking on floors 1-2, and 54 residential units on floors 3-6. The footprint of the property projects out 9'3" from the block's historic building line and into the City ROW, requiring either a major encroachment or an abandonment of City property. The main north and south facing facades are articulated by projecting bays that project above the roofline. The corners of the building feature square towers that end above the roof line. The building features a regular fenestration pattern of one-over-one, double-hung windows on floors 3-6. The ground floor of the parking garage features mesh-filled openings meant to resemble storefront openings. The second floor of the garage features meshed openings matching the fenestration pattern on the upper floors. The entrance to the parking garage is located on the south side of the new construction and the exit is located facing Franklin Street.

The Board reviewed the plans and agreed that it could not recommend approval of the application as submitted. The Board noted that the scale of the new construction, including its height and massing, overwhelms the historic Amos Block. C. Carter noted that this was compounded by the fact that the new construction projects 9' beyond the Amos Block's primary façade. The applicants indicated that the additional floor area was needed for the layout of the apartments and garage. They also noted that historically, the buildings on this block were of various heights. J. Marshall said that the architectural elements above the roofline accentuated the scale issue and suggested simplifying the roof edge. She also suggested that the second floor façade design was also contributing to the scale issues and that they might consider removing the "window" openings and/or altering the height of the horizontal datum lines above and below the second story so that they corresponded more closely with the Amos Building. D. Radke highlighted the importance of the design of the connection between the Amos Block and the new addition. The Board also was concerned about the placement of the parking garage entrance on W. Water Street immediately adjacent to the Amos Block. The Board requested that the applicants consider the feasibility of placing the entrance on the Erie Blvd side of the building instead.

Sign Waiver (AS-17-10): 357-59 S. Warren Street. The Board reviewed the application materials. K. Auwaerter noted that Common Space occupied over 50 percent of the building. It was also noted that the proposed sign was made up of individual channel lettering, which is a type of signage that the Board had approved in the past. The Board agreed to approve the application as submitted.

Discussion

Local Protected Site evaluation: 1027 E. Genesee Street. Norm Swanson (owner) and Mike O'Shea (QPK) were present at the meeting. M. O'Shea directed the Board's attention to the report that his firm had completed regarding the history and condition of the house. He noted that the building was constructed around 1911. He said that their research had uncovered no associations with individuals of note, nor had they identified an architect. The house itself has been altered and added to over the years. In the 1980s, Ronald McDonald House Inc purchased the house and the house next door and connected the two with a ground-floor addition. At the same time, the interior was significantly renovated so that only the front room of the house is original. N. Swanson noted that the house next door was designed by Ward Wellington Ward and he intends to remove the addition between the two houses and restore the exterior façade of the Ward house. They noted that the character of this section of E. Genesee Street had changed and that it was now a largely commercial and high-rise residential area.

Board members reviewed the materials. B. Haley asked if there were any historic images of the house that would indicate if the front porch was original to the house. It was noted that early Sanborn maps might indicate the configuration of the original porch, if any. He noted that E. Genesee Street-- like James Street -- was at one

time lined with larger houses and mansions and that these two houses represent that period of the city's history. D. Radke commented that he was not sure if a strong case could be made for the house. In conclusion, the Board determined that it did not have sufficient information to determine whether or not the building should be forwarded to a public hearing for a local Protected Site designation. It requested that the owner and/or his consultant search for any images or other documentation regarding the historic appearance of the house. K. Auwaerter noted that she had some mapping materials that might be useful.

National Register Listing: Morgan A. Dunne House (464 Allen Street). The Board reviewed the National Register nomination for the Dunne House and agreed that it appeared to meet the criteria for nomination to the National Register. Staff will write to SHPO expressing the Board's support of the application.

ADJOURN

The meeting was adjourned at 10:00 AM.