



*SYRACUSE
LANDMARK
PRESERVATION
BOARD*

**Landmark Preservation Board
Thursday, March 18, 2010**

Meeting Minutes

8:30 am Common Council Chambers

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Don Radke called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m.

ROLL CALL

Members Present: Louise Birkhead, Kelly Colabello, Tim Bonaparte, Bob Haley, Dan Leary, Julia Marshall, Don Radke

Excused: Jeff Romano, Fouad Dietz,

Staff: Kate Auwaerter

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

L. Birkhead moved to accept the minutes of the March 4, 2010 meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by B. Haley and approved unanimously.

OLD BUSINESS

CA-09-35 703 Walnut Avenue. David Harding (Stopen Engineering), Tom Piscitell (Paragon) and Carmen Davoli (applicant) were present at the meeting. D. Harden briefly described the project to rebuild the wall in front of 703 Walnut Avenue. Photographs and a pattern elevation were presented. D. Harden explained that given the state of the wall, they estimate only 25% recovery rate of the original stone. T. Piscitell noted that the existing stone is a local limestone that weathers over time to a lighter beige, but comes out of the quarry almost black in color. If the recovered stone was to be reused, then he recommended using a Seneca Limestone from Ohio that has a similar color as the weathered local stone to aid in blending the old with the new. The existing capstone is a bluestone that has delaminated. The applicants had not determined whether or not to install a capstone; T. Piscitell noted that he did not believe that the capstone was original to the wall. The board discussed whether it would be worth salvaging the existing stone given that they were replacing with appropriate materials. D. Leary made a motion to accept the proposal as submitted with the provision that as much of the original stone be salvaged and reused as technically feasible. The decision regarding how much could be salvaged would be made in the field. If a capstone is necessary, it should be compatible with the capstone on the adjacent wall, as appropriate. The type of limestone (local or Seneca) will be at the discretion of the applicants based on the ability to blend the old stone with the new. The motion was seconded by L. Birkhead and carried unanimously.

CA-10-1 1631 S. Salina Street (Gothic Cottage). K. Auwaerter and B. Haley reported that they had visited the property. B. Haley noted that although it was in poor condition, the integrity of the property was mostly intact and is a major component of the South Salina Street Historic District. In particular, he described the notable interior features of the property including the arrangement of the interior spaces, curved staircase, paneled doors and molding. He also noted the potential cost of stabilization and rehabilitation. B. Haley made a motion to deny the application for demolition based on the fact that the property retained its architectural and historical integrity. The motion was seconded by K. Colabello and approved by majority vote. T. Bonaparte and D. Leary voted no and J. Marshall abstained.

LPS-10-01: Holy Trinity Church. K. Auwaerter presented the Crawford & Stearns evaluation of the property for designation as a local Protected Site. Crawford & Stearns found that the property is eligible for local designation under Criteria 1, 2, 3 and 5. S. Gruber presented additional historical information about the church as well as more information about the stained glass windows. L. Birkhead made a motion to recommend local designation and move the application to a public hearing. The motion was seconded by D. Leary and approved unanimously.

NEW BUSINESS

Sign Waiver: 500-52 S. Salina Street. The SLPB discussed the two signs (“500” and “UA Towers”) facing the S. Salina Street/W. Onondaga Street corner. The sign waiver is required because the existing street number was large enough that the Zoning Office considers it a sign. The additional identifier (“UA Towers”) is, therefore, considered a second sign on the same façade, which is one more than is allowed by the Sign Ordinance. There was discussion about whether or not the lettering for the new “UA Towers” sign should match the font type of the street number. However, the final conclusion of the SLPB was to recommend that only a single sign be allowed on the façade in accordance with the Sign Ordinance.

DISCUSSION

LPS application: 678 W. Onondaga Street. Kathy Discenna, executive director of the Land of Oz Preservation Company presented a brief introduction to the property which she would like to nominate for local Protected Site status. This house was owned by William Neal, a prominent merchant in the city. It is one of the few remaining mansions of what was once a very fashionable entrance street into the city. It was also where Frank Baum, author of the Wizard of Oz, met his future wife, Maud Gage. Sam Gruber noted that a lot of research has been completed on this house as part of an unsuccessful National Register nomination for a historic district along W. Onondaga Street. The board authorized K. Auwaerter to request a report from Crawford & Stearns evaluating the property for local Protected Site status.

Onondaga Park Fire Barn Reuse. Jake Smith (RSA Architects) and Glen Lewis (Parks Department) presented the information. Onondaga Park (and its associated structures) is a local Protected Site. The City has received an EPF grant to renovate the fire barn and convert it into a community center with a focus on environmental education. The SHPO has worked closely with the architects on the rehabilitation. J. Smith explained that the largest issue is the lead and asbestos abatement in the building. Testing indicated that asbestos had leached into the window glass itself, requiring that all the windows must be reconstructed with new glass. He noted that the only demolition in the plans was the removal of a shed addition on the front façade of the building. K. Auwaerter noted that in her conversations with Chris Capella-Peters, the demolition of the addition was the only unresolved item with the SHPO.

The board had the following comments which it requested be forwarded to the SHPO: The board recommended that instead of a large, single-pane storm window installed in front of the second-story hay loft doors that they consider a storm with a mullion and muntin pattern that would break up the wide expanse of glass. This would also eliminate the need for an interior guardrail. The board also recommended that they test the glass again for asbestos since it seemed implausible that asbestos could contaminate the actual glass. This would allow for the retention of the glass and create a possible cost savings.

The board also recommended that the applicant consider ways of retaining the window next to the elevator shaft rather than bricking it in. If it is to be bricked in, the board recommended a darker color brick for the infill than the surrounding brick. If financially feasible, the board recommended that brick pavers be installed where the original driveway for the fire trucks was located, which would help break up the otherwise vast expanse of asphalt in front of the building. Finally, the board suggested that they consider redirecting the gutters to leaders that could take water into interior downspouts at a possible cost savings to the project.

St. Paul’s exterior work. John Peasy from the St. Paul’s Cathedral came to discuss plans for a new external duct on the rear (west facing) façade of the property. The church needs to replace its kitchen stove and update the exhaust fan, resulting in the installation of a new duct on the exterior of the building. The board recommended

that the exhaust duct be brought directly to the roof line avoiding the existing scupper. It recommended that the duct be galvanized and not painted. The Cathedral will submit a formal CofA based on the recommendations of the board.

LPS designations for 220 and 115 Green Street. D. Radke noted that both Green Street properties were unanimously approved for LPS designation by the Common Council. B. Haley noted that the Department of Neighborhood & Business Development was actively behind the designation and there was also good neighborhood support for the designations. B. Haley reminded the board that it was important that the LPB members come to the public hearings and other discussions at the Planning Commission and the Common Council in order to be supportive of the designations.

ADJOURN

D. Leary made a motion to adjourn, which was seconded by L. Birkhead. The meeting adjourned at 10:00 a.m.